Documenting Teaching Effectiveness: A Guided Self-Assessment Tool

This document is intended to serve as a **self-assessment tool** for faculty members as they reflect on their teaching and learning practices in preparation for annual review and tenure and promotion. Please review the categories listed below as a self-assessment only as we should be mindful of our specific department/college evaluation criteria. This resource is informed by scholarship on documenting teaching effectiveness and best-teaching and learning practices. Additionally, the UTRGV Academy of Distinguished Teachers provided invaluable feedback and insights at various stages of revision. Through this tool, we can reflect on the multiple areas that inform teaching effectiveness and continuous improvement of teaching over time.

Additionally, this resource may also be used as a guide for colleges and/or departments to consider when writing and revising guidelines for evaluation of teaching effectiveness. Each department and/or college can specify categories and define the criteria it applies to departmental and discipline-based teaching values and beliefs. Specifically, these categories and how specific teaching effectiveness areas are defined should be adjusted as it applies to adjuncts, lecturers, assistant, associate, and full professors, respectively, and as it applies to annual review and tenure and promotion. Additionally, the website on Faculty Reviews under the Office of the Executive Vice President and Provost includes a "Best Practices for Creating and Revising Department Evaluation Guidelines for Annual Review, Promotion, and Tenure."

Other resources: The Center for Teaching Excellence created a guided resource for faculty members to reflect on how they may approach documenting teaching effectiveness and continuous improvement of teaching. Additionally, the CTE hosts an annual Teaching Conversation on Documenting Teaching Effectiveness for Annual Review and Tenure & Promotion each spring semester.

Teaching Categories & Guiding Questions	Early entry to teaching/beginner	Developing	Proficient	Exemplary
Teaching values & beliefs How do you reflect on your teaching values and beliefs over time?	There are general references to values and beliefs on teaching and cursory mention of alignment to other teaching areas.	Discusses values and beliefs about teaching in isolation with only minimal attempts to align those values and beliefs to specific practices. There are minimal to no references on how teaching has shifted as informed by student feedback, peer observations of teaching, course evaluations, professional development, and research-informed practices.	Reflects on teaching values and beliefs and how they align to teaching innovations, research-based teaching and learning practices, student learning outcomes, assessments, student feedback, and student needs. Offers some examples of how shifts in teaching values and beliefs are informed by student feedback, peer observations of teaching, course evaluations, professional development, and/or research-informed practices.	Critically reflects on teaching values and beliefs and how they align to teaching innovations, research-based teaching and learning practices, student learning outcomes, assessments, student feedback, and student needs. Provides multiple and varied examples of how shifts in teaching values and beliefs are informed by student feedback, peer observations of teaching, course evaluations, professional development, and research-informed practices.
Curriculum alignment How do you frame what students are expected to learn in the course and how course activities, assignments, and assessments align with the learning curriculum learning outcomes?	Measures to assess student learning are too narrow or broad, lack of alignment among activities, assignments, and assessments. No evidence of effort to understand and improve student learning.	Minimal evidence or unclear alignment between learning outcomes and assessment practices. There are minimal references to how these efforts contribute to continuous improvement of teaching and student learning.	Reflects on efforts to align course learning outcomes to specific, varied, and authentic assessments (e.g., exams, quizzes, projects, case study, reflections, team-based activities, etc.). There are some examples on how this alignment meets students' needs and varied strengths and how such efforts contribute to continuous	Critically reflects on efforts to support all students' learning through learning outcomes that align to specific, varied, and authentic assessments (e.g., exams, quizzes, projects, case study, reflections, team-based activities, etc.). There are multiple and varied examples (e.g., students' reflections, assessments, course

			improvement of teaching and student learning.	grades, etc.) on how this alignment meets students' needs and varied strengths and how such efforts contribute to continuous improvement of teaching and student learning.
Course design for student success How do you reflect on course design innovations (e.g., flipped classroom, augmented reality, effective use of technology, Open Educational Resources (OER), Universal Design for Learning, accessibility, scaffold learning, material and digital tools, among others.) implemented and the impact they have on student learning, engagement, and success? What are your pedagogical motives and what course design tool or innovation will help you get there? How do you draw on a variety of tools to interact and engage with students?	There is no rationale for teaching practices nor references to implementing any new innovations on teaching practices.	Lists innovative and creative teaching practices but there is minimal or no evidence of how pedagogical motives align to specific innovations and tools nor the impact of the innovations and how these are linked to specific learning outcomes, student learning and engagement and continuous improvement of teaching.	Reflects on specific and varied teaching and learning innovations that meet student needs by aligning them to specific learning outcomes. Some pedagogical motives are discussed in the context of aligning them to specific innovative tools to achieve teaching and learning goals. There are some examples and some evidence related to how innovation positively engages learners and contributes to continuous improvement of teaching practices.	Critically reflects on varied teaching and learning innovations that meet student needs by aligning them to specific learning outcomes. Specifically, align pedagogical motives to specific innovative tools to achieve teaching and learning goals. Provides multiple examples on the impact of the innovation on student learning and continuous improvement of teaching and learning practices overtime, specifically how it positively engages learners informed.
Research-based teaching strategies How do you reflect on research-based teaching strategies (e.g.,	Teaching practices are discussed without evidence of the research-based teaching practices used.	Names some research-based teaching practices; however, there is minimal evidence of how these are linked to specific teaching practices and impact on	Reflects on the evidence provided on the use of specific research-based teaching and learning strategies that align to student learning outcomes and student needs to inform teaching and learning practices.	Critically reflects on evidence provided related to the use of specific research-based teaching and learning strategies that align to student learning outcomes and

experiential/service learning, undergraduate research, study abroad, studio performances, problem-based learning, collaborative assignments, a new technology, culturally responsive practices, active learning/dynamic lecturing strategies, shift to learning as opposed to "grades" etc.), specifically on how they are linked to student learning outcomes, assessment, and student learning and engagement?		student learning and engagement and continuous improvement of teaching overtime.	Provides some examples to inform the impact of the research-based teaching and learning strategies on student learning, overall engagement, and continuous improvement of teaching overtime.	student needs to inform teaching and learning practices. Specific examples are provided to inform the impact of the research-based teaching and learning strategies on student learning, overall engagement, and continuous improvement of teaching overtime.
Course student evaluations and student feedback Beyond the numerical expectations for course evaluations, how do you contextualize course evaluations as aligned to student learning and continuous improvement of teaching?	Course evaluation averages are below 69% or its equivalent of 3.3 or below. Student course evaluations are dismissed or not referenced and there is no effort to collect and respond to student feedback to improve teaching and student learning.	Course evaluations average 70-79% in the Agree/ Strongly Agree category or its equivalent 3.4-3.9 weighted average. There is minimal evidence provided on reflections of course evaluations and student feedback to improve teaching.	Course evaluations average 80-89% in the Agree/ Strongly Agree category or its equivalent 4.0-4.4 weighted average. Contextualizes course evaluations and student feedback as aligned to other teaching effectiveness categories. There is some evidence of seeking additional student feedback on learning, reflecting on feedback, and implementing revisions to enhance student learning and engagement.	Course evaluations reflect a 90% or above in the Agree/Strongly Agree category or its equivalent 4.5 or above weighted average. Contextualizes course evaluations and other forms of feedback as aligned to the other teaching effectiveness categories. Evidence is provided on incorporating additional student feedback questions in course evaluations and collecting regular feedback from students. Reflections on data collected is provided and aligned to teaching revisions, learning outcomes, growth.
Seeking, Reflecting on, and Implementing Feedback from	Does not obtain peer observation of teaching or if they do the peer	Minimum number of required PoT with minimal evidence of reflection on	Minimum number of required PoT and provides some evidence of reflection on PoT feedback and notes	Critical reflects on evidence related to seeking peer observation of teaching beyond

Peer Observation of Teaching (PoT) How do you engage in eliciting and providing peer observation of teaching and how do you engage with the feedback provided/received? *These practices may be applicable to both the peer observer and observed.	observation of teaching is only a check list and not contextualized within continuous improvement of teaching practices.	PoT feedback and other elements of peer observation of teaching, such as 1. revisions to teaching informed by PoT, 2. implementations of revisions, and 3. impact on student learning and engagement are not addressed.	some revisions to teaching informed by PoT as well as the implementation; however, there is minimal reference on impact of revisions on student learning and engagement.	the minimum number required and provides exceptional evidence of 1. seeking specific feedback on teaching from peers, 2. reflecting on PoT feedback, 3. implementing revisions in subsequent semester, and 4. exploring the impact on student learning and engagement.
Professional Development Participation & Impact Beyond the number of professional development session (s) you attend, how do you represent the impact the professional development session(s) had on your continuous improvement of teaching and student learning?	The value of professional development activities is not noted or does not participate in professional development activities from the department, college, university, or academic conferences.	Lists professional development activities from the department, college, university, or academic conferences; however, there is minimal to no evidence provided on what was learned and how it was applied within the course. No evidence of the impact of PD on continuous improvement of teaching and student learning.	Lists of professional development activities from the department, college, university, or academic conferences and reflects on some of the teaching strategies learned and how they were applied within the course and what impact they had on continuous improvement of teaching and student learning.	Critically reflects on the impact of faculty development activities from the department, college, university, or academic conferences by contextualizing the activities and the application of teaching strategies learned, especially how they are aligned to continuous improvement in teaching and impact on student learning.
Professional Development Leadership & Impact How do you reflect on the impact of leading other instructors to reflect on their continuous improvement of teaching and student learning?	Does not facilitate or lead professional development sessions in teaching but may document some interest in informally sharing teaching materials/methods.	Informally shares teaching materials/methods Some involvement in dept teaching-related professional development. Minimal to no evidence related to the impact of professional development	Reflects on being a thought leader in PD on teaching within and across the department and college. Provides some examples of how they lead others in developing knowledge to improve teaching and student learning. There is minimal leadership and collaboration with the Center for	Critically reflects on the impact that being a thought leader in PD on teaching within and across the university community via collaborations with department, college, and the Center for Teaching Excellence (CTE) Center for Online Learning and Teaching Technology (COLTT) and colleges and other University-wide

		on teaching and learning practices.	Teaching Excellence (CTE) Center for Online Learning and Teaching Technology (COLTT) and other University-wide programs or initiatives.	initiatives had on teaching and student learning. Specifically, provides examples of how leading others in learning about teaching methods that positively influenced student learning and improving others' reflections on teaching values and continuous improvement of teaching practices.
Mentoring (chair/member, academic, undergraduate research, community engagement, guest speaker in classes, etc.) How do you engage in mentoring students beyond the classroom space, and how do you document the impact of these endeavors on student learning and teaching practices?	There is no evidence of mentoring activities beyond the classroom, but a plan is formulated for how to engage in mentoring beyond the classroom.	Lists mentoring activities beyond the classroom but does not link intersections with their teaching practices nor impact on student learning experiences and engagement.	Contextualizes mentoring activities beyond the classroom and some evidence related to intersections with their teaching practices and impact on student learning experiences and engagement.	Critically reflects on multiple mentoring activities (e.g., undergraduate research, graduate thesis or graduate portfolio committees, sponsorship of student organizations, mentoring, advisement, directing or serving as guest class speakers) and impact these endeavors have on teaching and learning practices in the classroom and student learning and engagement beyond the classroom.
Teaching, Research, Service Intersections How do you provide evidence on the impact of deliberate teaching, research, and service intersections, specifically as one centered on continuous improvement of teaching and	Teaching, research, and service are discussed in isolation/discreet from one another; there are opportunities where intersections may develop.	Lists teaching, research, and service activities with minimal exploration of contextual intersections and minimal evidence of impact on teaching practices and student learning and engagement.	Contextualizes teaching, research, and service intersection activities and how they align to each other; offers some evidence on the impact alignment has on student learning and engagement.	Critically reflects on and contextualizes alignment among teaching, research, and service, particularly and provides evidence of how such alignment contributes to better understanding students' needs, leading to student learning and engagement.

student learning and engagement?				
Awards How do you reflect on teaching awards at the local, national, international awards on teaching and the impact on your continuous improvement of teaching?	--	--	Seeks teaching award applications to reflect on continuous improvement of teaching and student learning.	Recognition of teaching award at the local, national, and/or international levels and reflects on how the award has contributed to continuous commitment to teaching and learning, specifically impacting teaching practices and student learning and engagement.