

Collaborative Annotations: Developing Students' Critical Reading, Thinking, Writing, and Teamwork Skills

Ian Werkheiser

Department of Philosophy

Center for Collaboration and Ethics

ian.werkheiser@utrgv.edu

(Some of) My Problems

- Students being unprepared for discussion in class, cramming for tests
- Vicious Circle of Explanation
- Difficulties for some students in participation (group or class)
- Guessing about confusion when preparing lesson plan
- Students need more writing practice
- Students need more domain-specific reading practice
- Students need more practice sharing ideas
- Building a “Community of Learners” took a large portion of the semester

Collaborative Annotation

- Annotating texts – writing comments, critiques, definitions, summaries in the margins of a text
- Better understanding
- Better retention

Handwritten notes on the right page of a notebook, including:

- Handwritten notes at the top: "a rust blason the less charged against earlier income."
- A circled note: "recondite Semantics"
- A circled note: "Office Study; midday 6 room full of midday"
- The title "DON DE LILLO'S PLAYERS" is written in large, bold letters.
- A circled note: "Bands Sin Killer Griffin"
- Vertical handwritten notes on the left margin: "We fear death mostly because we fear it'll be boring. We fear not the cessation of consciousness but its continuation in a realm of no input. We fear men in solitary drims and..."
- Vertical handwritten notes on the right margin: "Ed of Sweden, not yet a member of Russe Committee - but we see they're caught; nothing happens. but cut-off. Spied on him for months at public for protest"
- Vertical handwritten notes on the far right margin: "-6° out shit off a thick wooden stick."
- A boxed note at the bottom right: "Waiting man stands booming on his heels"
- Printed text on the page includes several quotes about Don DeLillo's *Players* by John Updike, Ardie Ivie, William J. Harding, Diane Johnson, and J.D. O'Hara.

Collaborative Annotation

- Collaborative Annotation – working as a group to annotate one text, and discuss with one-another in the margins.
- Help one-another learn about the reading
- Learn about one-another
- More engaging

*Secundum Augustinum monas & dias non sunt numeri sed principia numerorum in quo & quod
triat aut plus principium in calum & finem possidit & perfectio numerus est secundum istas autem dias numerus est.
Deo rianus est ab eo quod est deo rianus uel deo rianus sine uero. monas. omnem quod si neco uo est corporal
oral si uero in ca re/ si uero q' deo rianus p' d'ce bene primus qui principium est secundum uer' f' f' c' c'
principium ip' r' uer' f' f' c' c'*

*Utiosa mollitia & in irrupte p' genas subae penepdidit
iugena c' spicat. Quoda aspectu p' mittentis in lexu. Quasatna
qd' d'geru' p' d' uq; egressa ad udu cu' a l' u' femina m' r' d' e' c' a' u' s' i' n' g'
si u' t' o' n' a' i' s' n' a' t' a' l' i' b' ; e' t' u' q' ; p' c' e' l' s' i' o' r' . u' u' l' t' i' p' s' i' u' s' d' e' l' u' m' i' n' e' r' e' n' s'
bat. Nae p' ma c' e' f' r' o' m' e' d' e' u' n' o' s' ; u' i' x' i' n' t' e' l' l' e' g' i' b' i' l' i' r' a' d' i' o' c' a' n' d' i' c' a' b'
ebat. De hinc i' u' s' . & q' u' a' r' t' ; t' e' q' ; u' i' a' m' o' n' u' s' . d' e' c' o' r' u' c' i' a' ; p' m' i' h' o' n' e'
t' i' b' ; c' i' r' c' u' l' e' b' a' n' t' ; s' i' c' u' i' n' n' u' m' e' r' a' b' i' l' i' r' a' d' i' o' s' m' u' l' t' i' t' u' d' i' n' e' p' r' u' p' e' r' i'
nebat. Huius autem multiplice plurimae formaeque uel te q' d' d' a' u' e' l' a' m' i' q' u'
u' u' i' r' g' i' n' i' s' r' e' c' u' r' s' a' n' t' e' s' . & q' u' a' d' a' m' c' o' p' h' e' n' s' e' m' o' b' i' l' i' t' a' t' e' s' c' a' n' t' i' g' i'*

pg. 300-301

Kortin
Jack
Korlee
Riley

Collaborative Annotation

I can see how Aunt Alexandra is stereotyping the Cunninghams

"The thing is, you can scrub Walter Cunningham till he shines, you can put him in shoes and a new suit, but he'll never be like Jem. Besides, there's a drinking streak in a mile wide, Finch women aren't interested in that sort of people."

"Aun-ty," said Jem, "she ain't nine yet."

"She may as well learn it now."

I think Aunt Alexandra expects too much out of Scout

- Can do it in-person
- Excellent Exercise. However, for me,
 - Too Slow
 - Doesn't solve most of the problems

Aunt Alexandra had spoken. I was reminded vividly of the last time she had put her foot down. I never knew why. It was when I was absorbed with plans to visit Calpurnia's house—I was curious, interested; I wanted to be her company, to see how she lived, who her friends were. I might as well have wanted to see the other side of the moon. This time the tactics were different, but Aunt Alexandra's aim was the same. Perhaps this was why she had come to live with us—to help us choose our friends. I would hold her off as long as I could: "If they're good folks, then why can't I be nice to Walter?"

Walter will never be different no matter what.

I agree. Scout has a right to be friends with anyone
I think they should get to choose their own friends, not have them chosen for them

Collaborative Annotation

- Can be done online
 - Asynchronous
 - Doesn't take up class time/can lead to preparedness before class
 - External and Internal rewards
 - More feedback possible
 - Various metrics and analysis are easier
 - Depends on access to computers, favoring those who own them at home and who feel comfortable using them

Perusall.com

- Developed at Harvard by professors for their own classes
- Free
- Can use textbooks, uploaded pdf's, websites, etc.
- Easy to use as a website
- Lots of functionality
 - Confusion Report
 - Upvoting and tagging
 - Algorithmically generated grade suggestions
 - Linked with our LMS
- Drawbacks
 - Can't view one student's annotated text

Hypothes.is

- Developed at MIT by professors for their own classes
- Free and non-profit
- Can use uploaded pdf's, websites, etc.
- Easy to use once you install a Chrome extension
- Lots of functionality
 - Can make private notes
 - Linked with our LMS
 - Notifies instructors about questions
- Drawbacks
 - Only automatically counts original posts
 - Can only link to publicly accessible websites/articles

Annotation Studio

- Developed at MIT by professors for their own classes
- Free and non-profit
- Can read any pdf you send students
- Complicated to install and use for students, quite complicated for instructor
- LOTS of functionality
 - Most of those previously mentioned for Hypothes.is
 - Changing and improving all the time
- Drawbacks
 - Requires a significant time investment to play around with it

Good Practices

- If you have a large class, split them into learning communities/reading groups
- Consider linking it with LMS (Blackboard)
- Model everything – how to create an account and join, what a good comment looks like, etc.
- No anonymous accounts
- Stay on top of grading and replying to the notes, especially at first
- If a student isn't doing well, proactively ask them to come to your office to discuss it
- Give students an opportunity to print the documents (usually in settings, or on class LMS)
- Work with Accessibility Services, but has often been seen as an accommodation
- Encourage repeated readings and commenting

Reviews of Collaborative Annotation by UTRGV Students in an Intro to Philosophy Class

Description

What did you think of the online collaborative annotation of the texts? Were they helpful? Could I do something to make them more helpful in future classes?

- Have more video collaborative annotations.
- I think that the online collaborative annotations were helpful because whenever I wouldn't understand a certain paragraph from the text. I can just ask a question on the annotations or ask someone to explain a little more.
- I think the collaborative notes were useful because the notes people provided were very useful for getting a different perspective on the paper. When I was confused on what the author meant I would look at the notes to see if someone understood and they were able to provide a simpler explanation and explain. I think it would be beneficial to ask students to bring in questions that they thought were difficult or needed more explaining on so that they can have a better understanding of what the philosopher meant.
- I think they were very helpful, if i didn't understand the text or a certain paragraph and to see it highlighted it was nice just to click on it and see what others thought it might be saying or have ideas on what was being said.
- I thought they were straight forward and helpful in analyzing what we were reading especially because some could be difficult to understand so it was relieving to know others had similar questions as mine. I thought that you did a good job in going over major concerns in class the following day after the readings
- The collaborative annotations were helpful and they helped me gain a better insight and somewhat of an understanding of the topic for the next lecture.
- Yes they were helpful and you should continue to do them!
- helpful
- i thought the online collaborative annotations were a good idea. it allows the class to engage with another through a way where we might be less shy to talk with another compared to discussing in class. i thought they were helpful because from reading others notes, i would get inspired and write down my own thoughts. i think this idea is great and should be used in different classes too.

(Some of) My Problems

- Students being unprepared for discussion in class, cramming for tests
- Vicious Circle of Explanation
- Difficulties for some students in participation (group or class)
- Guessing about confusion when preparing lesson plan
- Students need more writing practice
- Students need more domain-specific reading practice
- Students need more practice sharing ideas
- Building a “Community of Learners” took a large portion of the semester

Reflection – On Technology

- Access issues (pro and con) discussed above
- Reading on screens vs. reading on paper
- Discussing online vs. discussing in person

Natura unitatis simplex & cōtinua & indivisibilis. Inco[m]posita & p[ar]tibus: ac dicitur p[er] se p[er]manens & nullis comparatib[us] mutabilis. ac p[ro]p[ri]o s[er]vato & uera unitas sola animo considerat. nullo sensu composita. ut dicitur p[er] se unitas nullo sensu composita. Cetero uero n[on] numerum & p[ar]tes. idemq[ue] p[er] se p[er]manens & ad inferiora uel dicitur mutabilis. sentitur. ac p[ro]p[ri]o s[er]vato & uera unitas sola animo considerat. nullo sensu composita. ut dicitur p[er] se unitas nullo sensu composita. Cetero uero n[on] numerum & p[ar]tes. idemq[ue] p[er] se p[er]manens & ad inferiora uel dicitur mutabilis. sentitur. ac p[ro]p[ri]o s[er]vato & uera unitas sola animo considerat. nullo sensu composita. ut dicitur p[er] se unitas nullo sensu composita.

... principia numerorum in aquo & p[er] quod
... secundum ista uel dicitur numerus
... manifestat ipse
... in irrupte p[er] genas subae p[er] enep dicitur
... Quodā aspectu p[er]mittentis in lex: Quā s[er]ua
... peducq[ue] egressa ducūcū alu femina miri decas in
... siustona Jis natalib[us] & tuq[ue] p[er] celsior. uulpsus de lumine r[ati]o
... bat. Nā p[er]ma cōfronte de uno s[er] uix intelligibili radio candic
... ebat. De hinc ius. & quart[us] t[er]q[ue] uia monus de aruicq[ue] p[er] hinc
... tib[us] circulebant. sicū innumerabili radios multitudine p[er] r[ati]o
... hebat. Huius autē multa plice plur[im]a formēq[ue] uel te q[ue] dā uel a m[er]q[ue]
... u[er]ginis recur saules. & quadā in cōphensē mobilitate s[er]uig[ue]

Reflection – A Community of Learners

- Actively engage in learning from one another—learners from teachers, teachers from learners, and learners from learners.
- Supports diverse student capabilities by enabling all members to participate at their level of expertise and comfort
- Characterized by feelings of safety among participants, as well as willingness to ask questions and make mistakes.
- Motivates students so that they are more willing to persist when they are challenged or confused.

3. a. secundum agendum motus & dies non sunt numeri sed principia numerorum in quo & quod
transiunt & sunt principium in alium & finem possidit & perfectionem numerus dicitur secundum istas tres dicitur numerus.
Dicitur autem ista de eo quod est ad eam uel de aeternitate sua. sine aeternitate & motu. omnem quod si aeternus est capitalis
oralis studium carere. si ita quod de aeternitate sua dicitur bene primus. qui principia numerorum secundum istas tres
principium per aeternitatem.

Amantissimi affectus & primum
Sicut solent castigare obprobria laudat
arguunt

Natura unitatis simplex & simpliciter
In eo posita per se ab eo in se
& nullis comparabilibus in unum
suis & uera unitas sola in se consistit
nullo sensu composita. ut dicitur in omni numero
nos in se composita. Ceterum uero numerus in
se posita. idemque possessio per se ab eo in se
in se posita ut dicitur in omni numero. sententia
de phasice sola in se consistit. sed in se opinio po
tente in se consistit. de numero de solo in se consistit
si se habent in se in omni numero. de numero in se
tunc in se consistit. habet in se in se in se in se.

Thank You

Ian Werkheiser

Department of Philosophy

Center for Collaboration and Ethics

ian.werkheiser@utrgv.edu

luciosa mollitiae & in irrupte pgenas subae penep dicit
iugena cspicat. Quoda aspectu pmit tentis in lex. Quasat nia
egressa duducua alu femina miri decas in
talib; et uq; pcali or. uulpi sus de lumine r em
Napma est onade uno si uix intelligibili radio candic
Dehinc ius. Equat; teq; uia monus de aeternitate; p m h om
tib; circulebant; sicu innumerabili radios multitudine p r u p
hebat. Huius autem multa plice pluri formae; uel te qatda uel a in qu
u uirginis recur saules. & quoda inco phens; mobilitas scung